



**The Abdus Salam
International Centre for Theoretical Physics**



2052-32

Summer College on Plasma Physics

10 - 28 August 2009

**Tutorial on the theory of plasma turbulence
(Part I)**

Peter H. Yoon
*University of Maryland
USA*

Summer College on Plasma Physics

Trieste, Italy, 18 August 2009

Tutorial on the theory of plasma turbulence (Part I)

P. H. Yoon (UMD/KHU)



Kyung Hee University

References

- Kadomtsev, *Plasma Turbulence* (1965)
- Tsytovich, *Nonlinear Effects in a Plasma* (1970)
- Davidson *Methods in Nonlinear Plasma Theory* (1972)
- A I Akhiezer, et al., *Plasma Electrodynamics, Vol. 2* (1975)
- Tsytovich, *Theory of Turbulent Plasma* (1977)
- Melrose, *Plasma Astrophysics* (1980)
- Sitenko, *Fluctuations and Nonlinear Wave Interactions in Plasmas* (1982)

Vlasov-Poisson equation

$$\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + v \frac{\partial}{\partial x} + \frac{e_a E}{m_a} \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \right) f_a = 0,$$
$$\frac{\partial E}{\partial x} = 4\pi \hat{n} \sum_a e_a \int dv f_a.$$

Separation into Average and Fluctuation

$$f_a(x, v, t) = F_a(v, t) + \delta f_a(x, v, t),$$
$$E(x, t) = \delta E(x, t).$$

Rewrite the equations

$$\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \right) F_a + \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + v \frac{\partial}{\partial x} + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \right) \delta f_a = 0,$$
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \delta E = 4\pi \hat{n} \sum_a e_a \int dv \delta f_a.$$

Random phase approximation

$$\langle \delta f_a \rangle = 0, \quad \langle \delta E \rangle = 0.$$

Upon averaging

$$\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \right) F_a + \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + v \frac{\partial}{\partial x} + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \right) \delta f_a = 0,$$

we have

$$\frac{\partial F_a}{\partial t} = -\frac{e_a}{m_a} \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \langle \delta f_a \delta E \rangle.$$

Insert the above to original equation

$$\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + v \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \right) \delta f_a = -\frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v} - \frac{e_a}{m_a} \frac{\partial}{\partial v} (\delta f_a \delta E - \langle \delta f_a \delta E \rangle).$$

Fourier-Laplace transformation:

$$\delta f_a(x, v, t) = \int dk \int_L d\omega \delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t) e^{ikx - i\omega t},$$

$$\delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int dx \int_0^\infty dt \delta f_a(x, v, t) e^{-ikx + i\omega t},$$

$$\delta E(x, t) = \int dk \int_L d\omega \delta E_{k\omega}(t) e^{ikx - i\omega t},$$

$$\delta E_{k\omega}(t) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int dx \int_0^\infty dt \delta E(x, t) e^{-ikx + i\omega t},$$

where the Landau integration path L has $i\sigma$ ($\sigma > 0$ and $\sigma \rightarrow 0$).

The **slow time-dependence of spectral amplitudes**, $\delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t)$ and $\delta E_{k\omega}(t)$, is a short-cut approach (a sleazy way to avoid rigorous multiple-time step analysis – for a full-fledged multiple-time scale analysis, see Davidson, 1972).

Formal equations are now expressed as follows:

$$\delta E_{k\omega}(t) = -i \sum_a \frac{4\pi\hat{n}e_a}{k} \int dv \delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t),$$

$$\frac{\partial F_a(v, t)}{\partial t} = -\frac{e_a}{m_a} \int dk \int d\omega \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \langle \delta E_{-k, -\omega}(t) \delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t) \rangle,$$

$$\left(\omega - kv + i \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \right) \delta f_{k\omega}^a(v, t) = -i \frac{e_a}{m_a} \delta E_{k\omega}(t) \frac{\partial F_a(v, t)}{\partial v}$$

$$- i \frac{e_a}{m_a} \int dk' \int d\omega' \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \left[\delta E_{k'\omega'}(t) \delta f_{k-k', \omega-\omega'}^a(v, t) \right]$$

$$- \langle \delta E_{k'\omega'}(t) \delta f_{k-k', \omega-\omega'}^a(v, t) \rangle .$$

New definition for ω ,

$$\omega \rightarrow \omega + i \partial / \partial t.$$

This is another short-cut trick.

Short-hand notations:

$$\begin{aligned}
 K &= (k, \omega), & E_K &= \delta E_{k\omega}, & f_K &= \delta f_{k\omega}^a, \\
 F &= F_a, & \int dK &= \int dk \int d\omega, \\
 g_K &= -i \frac{e_a}{m_a \omega - kv + i0} \frac{1}{\partial v}.
 \end{aligned}$$

Equation for the perturbed particle distribution:

$$f_K = g_K F E_K + \int dK' g_K (E_{K'} f_{K-K'} - \langle E_{K'} f_{K-K'} \rangle).$$

Iteration:

$$f_K = f_K^{(1)} + f_K^{(2)} + \dots, \quad (f_K^{(n)} \propto E_K^n).$$

$$f_K^{(1)} = g_K F E_K,$$

$$f_K^{(2)} = \int dK' g_K (E_{K'} f_{K-K'}^{(1)} - \langle E_{K'} f_{K-K'}^{(1)} \rangle)$$

$$= \int dK' g_K g_{K-K'} F (E_{K'} E_{K-K'} - \langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} \rangle).$$

Early monographs calculate up to $f_K^{(3)}$, but $f_K^{(3)}$ is unnecessary!

Simplified notations:

$$\sum_{1+2=K} = \int dK_1 \int dK_2 \delta(K_1 + K_2 - K),$$

$$E_1 = E_{K_1}, \quad E_2 = E_{K_2}, \quad g_1 = g_{K_1}, \quad g_2 = g_{K_2}.$$

Iterative solution for f_K

$$f_K = g_K F E_K + \sum_{1+2=K} g_K g_2 F (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle)$$

Symmetrized version

$$f_K = g_K F E_K + \sum_{1+2=K} \frac{1}{2} g_{1+2} (g_1 + g_2) F (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle).$$

Insert f_K to the perturbed Poisson equation,

$$E_K = -i \sum_a \frac{4\pi \hat{n} e_a}{k} \int dv f_K.$$

$$E_K = -i \sum_a \frac{4\pi\hat{n}e_a}{k} \int dv f_K,$$

$$f_K = g_K F E_K + \sum_{1+2=K} \frac{1}{2} g_{1+2} (g_1 + g_2) F (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle).$$

The above can be re-written as

$$0 = \left(1 + i \sum_a \frac{4\pi e_a \hat{n}}{k} \int dv g_K F \right) E_K + i \sum_{1+2=K} \frac{1}{2} \sum_a \frac{4\pi e_a \hat{n}}{k} \int dv g_{1+2} (g_1 + g_2) F (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle).$$

Linear and nonlinear susceptibility response functions,

$$\begin{aligned} \epsilon(K) &= 1 + \sum_a i \frac{4\pi e_a \hat{n}}{k} \int dv g_K F, \\ \chi_a^{(2)}(1|2) &= \frac{i}{2k_1 + k_2} \frac{4\pi e_a \hat{n}}{k} \int dv g_{1+2} (g_1 + g_2) F. \end{aligned}$$

$$\epsilon(K) = 1 + \sum_a \frac{\omega_{pa}^2}{k} \int dv \frac{\partial F_a / \partial v}{\omega - kv + i0},$$

$$\chi_a^{(2)}(1|2) = -\frac{i e_a \omega_{pa}^2}{2 m_a k_1 + k_2} \int dv \frac{1}{\omega_1 + \omega_2 - (k_1 + k_2)v + i0}$$

$$\times \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \left[\left(\frac{1}{\omega_1 - k_1 v + i0} + \frac{1}{\omega_2 - k_2 v + i0} \right) \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v} \right].$$

$$0 = \epsilon(K) E_K + \sum_{1+2=K} \chi^{(2)}(1|2) (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle).$$

Multiply $E_{K'}$ and take ensemble average

$$0 = \epsilon(K) \langle E_K E_{K'} \rangle + \sum_{1+2=K} \chi^{(2)}(1|2) \langle E_1 E_2 E_{K'} \rangle.$$

Homogeneous turbulence,

$$\langle E(x, t) E(x', t') \rangle = D(|x - x'|; t, t'),$$

Stationary turbulence,

$$\langle E(x, t) E(x', t') \rangle = D(x, x'; |t - t'|).$$

Homogeneous and stationary turbulence,

$$\langle E(x, t) E(x', t') \rangle = \langle E^2 \rangle_{x-x', t-t'}.$$

The spectral representation

$$\langle E_{k\omega} E_{k'\omega'} \rangle = \delta(k + k') \delta(\omega + \omega') \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega}.$$

$$0 = \epsilon(K) \langle E_K E_{K'} \rangle + \sum_{1+2=K} \chi^{(2)}(1|2) \langle E_1 E_2 E_{K'} \rangle,$$

\Rightarrow

$$0 = \epsilon(K) \langle E^2 \rangle_K + \sum_{1+2=K} \chi^{(2)}(1|2) \langle E_1 E_2 E_{-K} \rangle.$$

Three-Body Cumulant and Closure of Hierarchy: If E_K is linear eigenmode,

$$\epsilon(K) E_K = 0.$$

then by definition $\langle E_1 E_2 E_{-K} \rangle = 0$. But we are dealing with nonlinear theory, where

$$0 = \epsilon(K) E_K + \sum_{1+2=K} \chi^{(2)}(1|2) (E_1 E_2 - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle).$$

Let us write $E_K = E_K^{(0)} + E_K^{(1)}$, where $E_K^{(0)}$ satisfies $\epsilon(K) E_K^{(0)} = 0$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \epsilon(K) (E_K^{(0)} + E_K^{(1)}) \\ &= - \int dK' \chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K') (E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} - \langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} \rangle). \end{aligned}$$

By definition $\epsilon(K) E_K^{(0)} = 0$. Thus,

$$E_K^{(1)} = -\frac{1}{\epsilon(K)} \int dK' \chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K') \left(E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} - \langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} \rangle \right).$$

Three-body correlation,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle &= \langle (E_{K'}^{(0)} + E_{K'}^{(1)}) \\
 &\times (E_{K-K'}^{(0)} + E_{K-K'}^{(1)}) (E_{-K}^{(0)} + E_{-K}^{(1)}) \rangle \\
 &= \underbrace{\langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} E_{-K}^{(0)} \rangle}_{\substack{\parallel \\ 0}} + \langle E_{K'}^{(1)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} E_{-K}^{(0)} \rangle \\
 &+ \langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(1)} E_{-K}^{(0)} \rangle + \langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} E_{-K}^{(1)} \rangle, \\
 &\quad \uparrow
 \end{aligned}$$

$$E_K^{(1)} = -\frac{1}{\epsilon(K)} \int dK' \chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K') \left(E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} - \langle E_{K'}^{(0)} E_{K-K'}^{(0)} \rangle \right)$$

drop the superscript (0).

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle &= -\frac{1}{\epsilon(K')} \int dK'' \chi^{(2)}(K'' | K' - K'') \\
&\times \left(\langle E_{K''} E_{K'-K''} E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle - \langle E_{K''} E_{K'-K''} \rangle \langle E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle \right) \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{\epsilon(K-K')} \int dK'' \chi^{(2)}(K'' | K - K' - K'') \\
&\times \left(\langle E_{K''} E_{K-K'-K''} E_{K'} E_{-K} \rangle - \langle E_{K''} E_{K-K'-K''} \rangle \langle E_{K'} E_{-K} \rangle \right) \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{\epsilon(-K)} \int dK'' \chi^{(2)}(-K'' | -K + K'') \\
&\times \left(\langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} E_{-K''} E_{-K+K''} \rangle - \langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} \rangle \langle E_{-K''} E_{-K+K''} \rangle \right).
\end{aligned}$$

The closure: for homogeneous and stationary turbulence,

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle E_K E_{K'} E_{K''} E_{K'''} \rangle &= \delta(K + K' + K'' + K''') \\
&\times \left[\delta(K + K') \langle E^2 \rangle_K \langle E^2 \rangle_{K''} \right. \\
&\quad + \delta(K + K'') \langle E^2 \rangle_K \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \\
&\quad + \delta(K' + K'') \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K''} \\
&\quad \left. + \langle E^4 \rangle_{K;K+K';K+K'+K''} \right].
\end{aligned}$$

Ignoring irreducible four-body cumulant,

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle &= -\frac{\chi^{(2)}(-K + K'|K)}{\epsilon(K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&\quad - \frac{\chi^{(2)}(K| -K + K')}{\epsilon(K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&\quad - \frac{\chi^{(2)}(-K'|K)}{\epsilon(K - K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&\quad - \frac{\chi^{(2)}(K| -K')}{\epsilon(K - K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&\quad - \frac{\chi^{(2)}(-K'| -K + K')}{\epsilon(-K)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \\
&\quad - \frac{\chi^{(2)}(-K + K'| -K')}{\epsilon(-K)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} .
\end{aligned}$$

Symmetry Properties Associated With Nonlinear Susceptibility:

$$\chi^{(2)}(1|2) = -\frac{i}{2} \sum_a \frac{e_a}{m_a} \frac{\omega_{pa}^2}{k_1 + k_2} \int dv \frac{1}{\omega_1 + \omega_2 - (k_1 + k_2)v + i0} \\ \times \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \left[\left(\frac{1}{\omega_1 - k_1v + i0} + \frac{1}{\omega_2 - k_2v + i0} \right) \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v} \right].$$

Symmetry properties:

$$\chi^{(2)}(-1|-2) = \chi^{(2)*}(1|2), \\ \chi^{(2)}(1|2) = \chi^{(2)}(2|1).$$

Partial integrations,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \chi^{(2)}(1|2) &= -\frac{i}{2} \sum_a \frac{e_a}{m_a} \frac{\omega_{pa}^2}{k_1 + k_2} \int dv \frac{1}{\omega_1 + \omega_2 - (k_1 + k_2)v + i0} \\
 &\quad \times \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \left[\left(\frac{1}{\omega_1 - k_1v + i0} + \frac{1}{\omega_2 - k_2v + i0} \right) \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v} \right] \\
 &= \frac{-i}{2} \sum_a \frac{e_a}{m_a} \omega_{pa}^2 \int dv \frac{F_a}{(\omega_1 - k_1v)(\omega_2 - k_2v)[\omega_1 + \omega_2 - (k_1 + k_2)v]} \\
 &\quad \times \left(\frac{k_1}{\omega_1 - k_1v} + \frac{k_2}{\omega_2 - k_2v} + \frac{k_1 + k_2}{\omega_1 + \omega_2 - (k_1 + k_2)v} \right).
 \end{aligned}$$

Useful symmetry relation:

$$\chi^{(2)}(1|2) = \chi^{(2)}(2|1) = -\chi^{(2)}(1 + 2 | -2).$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\langle E_{K'} E_{K-K'} E_{-K} \rangle &= \frac{2\chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K')}{\epsilon(K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&+ \frac{2\chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K')}{\epsilon(K-K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&- \frac{2\chi^{(2)*}(K'|K-K')}{\epsilon^*(K)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} .
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
0 &= \epsilon(K) \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&+ 2 \int dK' \left(\frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K')\}^2}{\epsilon(K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \right. \\
&+ \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K')\}^2}{\epsilon(K-K')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_K \\
&\left. - \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(K'|K-K')|^2}{\epsilon^*(K)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{K-K'} \right) .
\end{aligned}$$

Reintroduce the slow time dependence,

$$(\omega - \mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{v} + i\partial/\partial t)^{-1}.$$

This leads to

$$\begin{aligned} \epsilon(k, \omega) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} &\rightarrow \epsilon\left(k, \omega + i\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \\ &\rightarrow \left(\epsilon(k, \omega) + \frac{i}{2} \frac{\partial \epsilon(k, \omega)}{\partial \omega} \frac{\partial}{\partial t}\right) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega}. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} 0 = & \frac{i}{2} \frac{\partial \epsilon(k, \omega)}{\partial \omega} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} + \epsilon(k, \omega) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \\ & + 2 \int dk' \int d\omega' \left(\frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega')\}^2}{\epsilon(k', \omega')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \right. \\ & + \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega')\}^2}{\epsilon(k - k', \omega - \omega')} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \\ & \left. - \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega')|^2}{\epsilon^*(k, \omega)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Dispersion relation,

$$\text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = 0.$$

Wave kinetic equation,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = & -\frac{2 \text{Im } \epsilon(k, \omega)}{\partial \text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) / \partial \omega} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \\ & - \frac{4}{\partial \text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) / \partial \omega} \text{Im} \int dk' \int d\omega' \\ & \times \left[\left\{ \chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega') \right\}^2 \left(\frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'}}{\epsilon(k', \omega')} \right. \right. \\ & \left. \left. + \frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'}}{\epsilon(k - k', \omega - \omega')} \right) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \right. \\ & \left. - \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega')|^2}{\epsilon^*(k, \omega)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'} \right]. \end{aligned}$$

Particle kinetic equation,

$$\frac{\partial F_a}{\partial t} = -\frac{e_a}{m_a} \int dK \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \langle E_{-K} f_K^a \rangle,$$

where

$$f_K = f_K^{(1)} + f_K^{(2)} + \dots$$

For evaluation of particle kinetic equation **we only use $f_K^{(1)}$** ,

$$f_K = f_K^{(1)} = g_K F E_K = -i \frac{e_a}{m_a} \frac{E_{k\omega}}{\omega - kv} \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v}.$$

Why? **Because higher-order terms lead to divergence!**

$$\frac{\partial F_a}{\partial t} = \text{Re} i \frac{e_a^2}{m_a^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \int dk \int d\omega \frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega}}{\omega - kv + i0} \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v}.$$

$$\text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = 0.$$

$$\frac{\partial F_a}{\partial t} = \text{Re } i \frac{e_a^2}{m_a^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \int dk \int d\omega \frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega}}{\omega - kv + i0} \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v}.$$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = & - \frac{2 \text{Im } \epsilon(k, \omega)}{\partial \text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) / \partial \omega} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \\ & - \frac{4}{\partial \text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) / \partial \omega} \text{Im} \int dk' \int d\omega' \\ & \times \left[\left\{ \chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega') \right\}^2 \left(\frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'}}{\epsilon(k', \omega')} \right. \right. \\ & \left. \left. + \frac{\langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'}}{\epsilon(k - k', \omega - \omega')} \right) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} \right. \\ & \left. - \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(k', \omega' | k - k', \omega - \omega')|^2}{\epsilon^*(k, \omega)} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'} \right]. \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Re } \epsilon(k, \omega) \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = 0, \quad \Rightarrow \quad \omega = \omega_k^\alpha \quad (\alpha = L, S).$$

$$\begin{aligned} \langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} &= \sum_{\alpha} \left[I_k^{+\alpha} \delta(\omega - \omega_k^\alpha) + I_k^{-\alpha} \delta(\omega + \omega_k^\alpha) \right] \\ &= \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \delta(\omega - \sigma\omega_k^\alpha). \end{aligned}$$

In the literature, the sign of wave phase speed σ is often not carefully taken care of!

Particle kinetic equation,

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial t} &= \frac{\partial}{\partial v} \left(D \frac{\partial F_a}{\partial v} \right), \\ D &= \frac{\pi e_a^2}{m_a^2} \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} \int dk I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \delta(\sigma\omega_k^\alpha - kv). \end{aligned}$$

Wave kinetic equation

$$\langle E^2 \rangle_{k\omega} = \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \delta(\omega - \sigma\omega_k^\alpha),$$

$$\langle E^2 \rangle_{k'\omega'} = \sum_{\sigma'=\pm 1} \sum_{\beta} I_{k'}^{\sigma'\beta} \delta(\omega' - \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta),$$

$$\langle E^2 \rangle_{k-k', \omega-\omega'} = \sum_{\sigma''=\pm 1} \sum_{\gamma} I_{k-k'}^{\sigma''\gamma} \delta(\omega - \omega' - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma),$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} \frac{\partial I_k^{\sigma\alpha}}{\partial t} \delta(\omega - \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) \\ &= - \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} \frac{2 \operatorname{Im} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha)}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \delta(\omega - \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) \\ & - 4 \operatorname{Im} \int dk' \left[\sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \sum_{\alpha} \frac{1}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} \right. \\ & \times \left. \left(\sum_{\sigma''=\pm 1} \sum_{\gamma} \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma | k - k', \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)\}^2}{\epsilon(k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)} I_{k-k'}^{\sigma''\gamma} \right) \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \sum_{\sigma'=\pm 1} \sum_{\beta} \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} | k - k', \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha} - \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta})\}^2}{\epsilon(k - k', \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha} - \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta})} I_{k'}^{\sigma' \beta} \Big) I_k^{\sigma \alpha} \delta(\omega - \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha}) \\
& - \frac{1}{\partial \text{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} + \sigma'' \omega_{k-k'}^{\gamma}) / \partial (\sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} + \sigma'' \omega_{k-k'}^{\gamma})} \\
& \times \sum_{\sigma', \sigma''=\pm 1} \sum_{\beta, \gamma} \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} | k - k', \sigma'' \omega_{k-k'}^{\gamma})|^2}{\epsilon^*(k, \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} + \sigma'' \omega_{k-k'}^{\gamma})} \\
& \times \left. I_{k'}^{\sigma' \beta} I_{k-k'}^{\sigma'' \gamma} \delta(\omega - \sigma' \omega_{k'}^{\beta} - \sigma'' \omega_{k-k'}^{\gamma}) \right].
\end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon(k, \omega)} = \mathcal{P} \frac{1}{\epsilon(k, \omega)} - \sum_{\alpha} \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \frac{i\pi \delta(\omega - \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha})}{\partial \text{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha}) / \partial \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha}},$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon^*(k, \omega)} = \mathcal{P} \frac{1}{\epsilon^*(k, \omega)} + \sum_{\alpha} \sum_{\sigma=\pm 1} \frac{i\pi \delta(\omega - \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha})}{\partial \text{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha}) / \partial \sigma \omega_k^{\alpha}}.$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \frac{\partial I_k^{\sigma\alpha}}{\partial t} = -\frac{2 \operatorname{Im} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha)}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \\
& - \frac{4}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} \operatorname{Im} \int dk' \\
& \times \left[\sum_{\sigma''=\pm 1} \sum_{\gamma} \mathcal{P} \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma | k - k', \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)\}^2}{\epsilon(k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)} I_{k-k'}^{\sigma''\gamma} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \right. \\
& + \left. \sum_{\sigma'=\pm 1} \sum_{\beta} \mathcal{P} \frac{\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta | k - k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta)\}^2}{\epsilon(k - k', \sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta)} I_{k'}^{\sigma'\beta} I_k^{\sigma\alpha} \right] \\
& + \frac{4\pi}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} \sum_{\sigma', \sigma''=\pm 1} \sum_{\beta, \gamma} \\
& \times \operatorname{Im} \int dk' \left[\{\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta | k - k', \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)\}^2 \right. \\
& \times \left(\frac{I_{k-k'}^{\sigma''\gamma} I_k^{\sigma\alpha}}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k', \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta) / \partial \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta} + \frac{I_{k'}^{\sigma'\beta} I_k^{\sigma\alpha}}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k - k', \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma) / \partial \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma} \right) \\
& \left. + \frac{|\chi^{(2)}(k', \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta | k - k', \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma)|^2}{\partial \operatorname{Re} \epsilon(k, \sigma\omega_k^\alpha) / \partial \sigma\omega_k^\alpha} I_{k'}^{\sigma'\beta} I_{k-k'}^{\sigma''\gamma} \right] \delta(\sigma\omega_k^\alpha - \sigma'\omega_{k'}^\beta - \sigma''\omega_{k-k'}^\gamma).
\end{aligned}$$