ICTP/Psi-k/CECAM School on Electron-Phonon Physics from First Principles

Trieste, 19-23 March 2018



Lecture Thu.1

Electron-phonon effects in ARPES and IXS

Feliciano Giustino

Department of Materials, University of Oxford Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Cornell University

Lecture Summary

- Satellites in photoelectron spectroscopy
- Phonon Green's function and self-energy
- Connection with density-functional perturbation theory
- Non-adiabatic phonons
- Phonon lifetimes
- Electron-phonon matrix element and Fröhlich interaction

Angle-resolved photoelectron spectroscopy (ARPES)



commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:ARPESgeneral.png

ARPES kinks and satellites



Figure from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)

ARPES kinks and satellites



Figure from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)

ARPES on doped transition-metal oxides



Momentum

ARPES on doped transition-metal oxides



ARPES on doped transition-metal oxides

• Example: SrTiO₃(001) surface



Figure from Wang et al, Nature Mater. 15, 835 (2016)

Diagrammatic representation of the self-energy





Aryasetiawan et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 2268 (1996); Gumhalter et al, Phys. Rev. B 94, 035103 (2016); Zhou et al, J. Chem. Phys. 143, 184109 (2015); Nery et al, arXiv:1710.07594 (2017); &

Giustino, Lecture Thu.1

09/36



Aryasetiawan et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 2268 (1996); Gumhalter et al, Phys. Rev. B 94, 035103 (2016); Zhou et al, J. Chem. Phys. 143, 184109 (2015); Nery et al, arXiv:1710.07594 (2017); &



Aryasetiawan et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 2268 (1996); Gumhalter et al, Phys. Rev. B 94, 035103 (2016); Zhou et al, J. Chem. Phys. 143, 184109 (2015); Nery et al, arXiv:1710.07594 (2017); &



Aryasetiawan et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 2268 (1996); Gumhalter et al, Phys. Rev. B 94, 035103 (2016); Zhou et al, J. Chem. Phys. 143, 184109 (2015); Nery et al, arXiv:1710.07594 (2017); &



Figure from Verdi et al, Nat. Commun. 8, 15769 (2017)

Giustino, Lecture Thu.1

• Example: n-doped TiO₂ anatase





Central quantity to study phonons in a many-body framework: the displacement-displacement correlation function (Lecture Wed.1)

$$\mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \langle \hat{T} \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa}(t) \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa'}^{\mathsf{T}}(t') \rangle$$

 $3{\times}3$ matrices in the Cartesian coordinates

Central quantity to study phonons in a many-body framework: the displacement-displacement correlation function (Lecture Wed.1)

$$\mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \langle \hat{T} \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa}(t) \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa'}^{\mathsf{T}}(t') \rangle$$

 $3{\times}3$ matrices in the Cartesian coordinates

Heisenberg time evolution of atomic displacements

$$i\hbar \frac{d}{dt}\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t) = [\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t), \hat{H}]$$

Central quantity to study phonons in a many-body framework: the displacement-displacement correlation function (Lecture Wed.1)

$$\mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \langle \hat{T} \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa}(t) \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa'}^{\mathsf{T}}(t') \rangle$$

 $3{\times}3$ matrices in the Cartesian coordinates

Heisenberg time evolution of atomic displacements

$$i\hbar \frac{d}{dt}\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t) = [\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t), \hat{H}]$$

Make it look like Newton's equation by taking the 2nd derivative

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa} = -\frac{M_{\kappa}}{\hbar^2} [[\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}, \hat{H}], \hat{H}]$$

Central quantity to study phonons in a many-body framework: the displacement-displacement correlation function (Lecture Wed.1)

$$\mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \langle \hat{T} \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa}(t) \Delta \hat{\boldsymbol{\tau}}_{\kappa'}^{\mathsf{T}}(t') \rangle$$

 $3{\times}3$ matrices in the Cartesian coordinates

Heisenberg time evolution of atomic displacements

$$i\hbar \frac{d}{dt}\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t) = [\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}(t), \hat{H}]$$

Make it look like Newton's equation by taking the 2nd derivative

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa} = \underbrace{-\frac{M_{\kappa}}{\hbar^2} [[\Delta \hat{\tau}_{\kappa}, \hat{H}], \hat{H}]}_{\text{dimensions of force}}$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') =$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \,\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'') \,\mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \,\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'') \,\mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'')}_{\text{phonon self-energy}} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'')}_{\text{phonon self-energy}} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa} \partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}^{\mathrm{T}}} \int d\mathbf{r} \ \epsilon_{\mathrm{e}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa}, \mathbf{r}, \omega) \frac{e^2 Z_{\kappa} Z_{\kappa'}}{4\pi\epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r} - \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}|}$$

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'')}_{\text{phonon self-energy}} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa} \partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}^{\mathrm{T}}} \int d\mathbf{r} \ \epsilon_{\mathrm{e}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa}, \mathbf{r}, \omega) \frac{e^2 Z_{\kappa} Z_{\kappa'}}{4\pi\epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r} - \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}|} - \text{ (self force)}$$

Using Schwinger's functional derivative technique

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'')}_{\text{phonon self-energy}} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$\boldsymbol{\Pi}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}} \partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}^{\mathrm{T}}} \int d\mathbf{r} \, \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_{\mathrm{e}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}}, \mathbf{r}, \omega) \, \frac{e^2 Z_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}} Z_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}}{4\pi \epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r} - \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}|} \, - \, (\text{self force})$$

 Π contains the spring constants for a Coulomb interaction between nuclei, screened by the electronic dielectric matrix

Using Schwinger's functional derivative technique

$$M_{\kappa} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial t^2} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa\kappa'}(tt') = -\mathbf{I}_{3\times 3} \,\delta_{\kappa\kappa'} \delta(tt') - \sum_{\kappa''} \int dt'' \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\kappa''}(tt'')}_{\text{phonon self-energy}} \mathbf{D}_{\kappa''\kappa'}(t''t')$$

$$\boldsymbol{\Pi}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}} \partial \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}^{\mathrm{T}}} \int d\mathbf{r} \, \boldsymbol{\epsilon}_{\mathrm{e}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}}, \mathbf{r}, \omega) \, \frac{e^2 Z_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}} Z_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}}{4\pi \epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r} - \boldsymbol{\tau}_{\boldsymbol{\kappa}'}|} \, - \, (\text{self force})$$

 Π contains the spring constants for a Coulomb interaction between nuclei, screened by the electronic dielectric matrix

example:
$$E_{\text{tot}} = \frac{1}{2}C(\tau - \tau_0)^2 \longrightarrow \frac{\partial^2 E_{\text{tot}}}{\partial \tau^2} = C$$

$$\mathbf{D} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{D}_{11} & \mathbf{D}_{12} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{1N} \\ \mathbf{D}_{21} & \mathbf{D}_{22} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{2N} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{D}_{N1} & \mathbf{D}_{N2} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{NN} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}$$



$$\mathbf{D} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{D}_{11} & \mathbf{D}_{12} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{1N} \\ \mathbf{D}_{21} & \mathbf{D}_{22} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{2N} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{D}_{N1} & \mathbf{D}_{N2} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{NN} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}^{} \mathbf{\Pi} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{\Pi}_{11} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{12} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{1N} \\ \mathbf{\Pi}_{21} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{22} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{2N} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{\Pi}_{N1} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{N2} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{NN} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}^{}$$
$$\mathbf{M} = \begin{pmatrix} M_{1} & 0 & \dots & 0 \\ 0 & M_{2} & \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & M_{N} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}^{}$$

$$\mathbf{D} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{D}_{11} & \mathbf{D}_{12} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{1N} \\ \mathbf{D}_{21} & \mathbf{D}_{22} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{2N} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{D}_{N1} & \mathbf{D}_{N2} & \dots & \mathbf{D}_{NN} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N} \mathbf{\Pi} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{\Pi}_{11} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{12} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{1N} \\ \mathbf{\Pi}_{21} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{22} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{2N} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \mathbf{\Pi}_{N1} & \mathbf{\Pi}_{N2} & \dots & \mathbf{\Pi}_{NN} \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}$$
$$\mathbf{M} = \begin{pmatrix} M_1 & 0 & \dots & 0 \\ 0 & M_2 & \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & M_N \end{pmatrix}_{3N \times 3N}$$

Equation of motion for the displacement-displacement correlation function in matrix form

$$\mathbf{M}\,\omega^2\,\mathbf{D}(\omega)=\mathbf{I}_{3N\times 3N}+\mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)\,\mathbf{D}(\omega)$$

Formal solution: phonon Green's function in Cartesian coordinates

$$\mathbf{D}(\omega) = \left[\mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)\right]^{-1}$$

Formal solution: phonon Green's function in Cartesian coordinates

$$\mathbf{D}(\omega) = \left[\mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)\right]^{-1}$$

The resonant frequencies are the solutions of the nonlinear equations

$$\Omega(\omega) = \omega$$

where $\Omega^2(\omega)$ an eigenvalue of the many-body dynamical matrix

$$\mathbf{M}^{-1/2} \,\mathbf{\Pi}(\omega) \,\mathbf{M}^{-1/2} \longrightarrow \frac{\Pi_{\kappa\alpha,\kappa'\alpha'}(\omega)}{\sqrt{M_{\kappa}M_{\kappa'}}}$$

Connection with density-functional perturbation theory

$$\Pi_{\kappa\alpha,\kappa'\alpha'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \tau_{\kappa\alpha} \partial \tau_{\kappa'\alpha'}} \int d\mathbf{r} \ \epsilon_{\rm e}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa},\mathbf{r},\omega) \ \frac{e^2 Z_{\kappa} Z_{\kappa'}}{4\pi\epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r}-\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}|} - \text{(self force)}$$
$$\Pi_{\kappa\alpha,\kappa'\alpha'}(\omega) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial \tau_{\kappa\alpha} \partial \tau_{\kappa'\alpha'}} \int d\mathbf{r} \left[\epsilon_{\mathbf{e}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa},\mathbf{r},\omega) \frac{e^2 Z_{\kappa} Z_{\kappa'}}{4\pi\epsilon_0 |\mathbf{r}-\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa'}|} - \text{(self force)} \right]$$





We call adiabatic self-energy the Π evaluated using the static screening

 $\mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathrm{A}} = \mathbf{\Pi} \left(\boldsymbol{\omega} \!=\! \boldsymbol{0} \right)$

We call adiabatic self-energy the Π evaluated using the static screening

 $\mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathrm{A}} = \mathbf{\Pi} \left(\boldsymbol{\omega} \!=\! \boldsymbol{0} \right)$

After some algebra this becomes

$$\mathbf{\Pi}_{\kappa\alpha,\kappa'\alpha'}^{\mathrm{A}} = \frac{\partial^2 U_{\mathrm{nn}}}{\partial \tau_{\kappa\alpha} \, \partial \tau_{\kappa'\alpha'}} + \int d\mathbf{r} \, \frac{\partial^2 V^{\mathrm{en}}(\mathbf{r})}{\partial \tau_{\kappa\alpha} \, \partial \tau_{\kappa'\alpha'}} \langle \hat{n}_{\mathrm{e}}(\mathbf{r}) \rangle + \int d\mathbf{r} \, \frac{\partial V^{\mathrm{en}}(\mathbf{r})}{\partial \tau_{\kappa\alpha}} \frac{\partial \langle \hat{n}_{\mathrm{e}}(\mathbf{r}) \rangle}{\partial \tau_{\kappa'\alpha'}}$$

We call adiabatic self-energy the Π evaluated using the static screening

 $\mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathrm{A}} = \mathbf{\Pi} \left(\boldsymbol{\omega} = 0 \right)$

After some algebra this becomes

We call adiabatic self-energy the Π evaluated using the static screening

 $\mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathrm{A}} = \mathbf{\Pi} \left(\boldsymbol{\omega} = 0 \right)$

DFPT matrix of force constants (Lecture Mon.2)

Relation between adiabatic and non-adiabatic Green's functions

$$\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)$$

Relation between adiabatic and non-adiabatic Green's functions

$$\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)$$
$$[\mathbf{D}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathbf{A}}$$

Relation between adiabatic and non-adiabatic Green's functions

$$\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)$$
$$[\mathbf{D}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathbf{A}}$$

$$-\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) + [\mathbf{D}^{A}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega) - \mathbf{\Pi}^{A}$$

Relation between adiabatic and non-adiabatic Green's functions

$$\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)$$
$$[\mathbf{D}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathbf{A}}$$

$$-\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) + [\mathbf{D}^{A}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega) - \mathbf{\Pi}^{A}$$

non-adiabatic self-energy $\Pi^{\rm NA}$

Relation between adiabatic and non-adiabatic Green's functions

$$\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}(\omega)$$
$$[\mathbf{D}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega)]^{-1} = \mathbf{M}\,\omega^2 - \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathbf{A}}$$

$$-\mathbf{D}^{-1}(\omega) + [\mathbf{D}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega)]^{-1} = \underbrace{\mathbf{\Pi}(\omega) - \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathbf{A}}}_{\text{rest odiabatic ordination of for even } \mathbf{L}}$$

non-adiabatic self-energy $\Pi^{\rm NA}$

Dyson's equation for the phonon Green's function

 $\mathbf{D} = \mathbf{D}^{\mathrm{A}} + \mathbf{D}^{\mathrm{A}} \, \mathbf{\Pi}^{\mathrm{NA}} \, \mathbf{D}$

Adiabatic phonon Green's function (DFPT)

(diagonal part in eigenmode representation)

$$D_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{A}(\omega) = \frac{2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^{2} - (\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i0^{+})^{2}} = \frac{1}{\omega - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} + i0^{+}} - \frac{1}{\omega + \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i0^{+}}$$

Adiabatic phonon Green's function (DFPT)

(diagonal part in eigenmode representation)

$$D_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathbf{A}}(\omega) = \frac{2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^{2} - (\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i0^{+})^{2}} = \frac{1}{\omega - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} + i0^{+}} - \frac{1}{\omega + \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i0^{+}}$$

Combine this with Dyson's equation to find the complete Green's function

$$D_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega) = \frac{2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2 - 2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega)}$$

Quasiparticle approximation

$$\frac{2\,\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2 - 2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega)} \xrightarrow{} \frac{2\,\tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2} \quad \text{with} \quad \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = \Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$$

Quasiparticle approximation

$$\frac{2\,\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2 - 2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega)} \xrightarrow{} \frac{2\,\tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2} \quad \text{with} \quad \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = \Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$$

$$\begin{split} \Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} &\simeq \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} + \operatorname{Re} \Pi^{\operatorname{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) & \text{frequency shift} \\ \gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} &\simeq \left| \operatorname{Im} \Pi^{\operatorname{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) \right| & \text{phonon broadening} \end{split}$$

(expressions valid when $|\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})| \ll \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$)

Quasiparticle approximation

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{2\,\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2 - 2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega)} & \longrightarrow \frac{2\,\tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2} \quad \text{with} \quad \tilde{\Omega}_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = \Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} - i\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} \\ \Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} &\simeq \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} + \operatorname{Re}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) & \text{frequency shift} \\ \gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} &\simeq \left|\operatorname{Im}\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right| & \text{phonon broadening} \\ & (\text{expressions valid when } |\Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})| \ll \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) \\ & \operatorname{Im} D_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{A}} & \bigwedge \operatorname{Im} D_{\mathbf{q}\nu} \end{aligned}$$

 $\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$

 $\Omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$

 $\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}$

frequency

Non-adiabatic self-energy



Figures from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)

Non-adiabatic self-energy



Dyson equation for the screened matrix element



Figures from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)





Figures from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)





Figures from Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017)

$$\begin{split} \hbar \,\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega) &= 2 \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g^{\mathrm{b}}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) g^{*}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) \\ &\times \left[\frac{f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}}}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar(\omega + i\eta)} - \frac{f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}}}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}}} \right] \end{split}$$







of electronic excitations



Dynamical structure on the scale of electronic excitations

Most calculations so far used the approximation or replacing $g^{\rm b}_{mn\nu}({f k},{f q})$ by $g_{mn\nu}({f k},{f q})$

$$\operatorname{Re} \Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\operatorname{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) = \frac{2}{\hbar} \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\operatorname{BZ}}} g_{mn\nu}^{\operatorname{b}}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) g_{mn\nu}^{*}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q})$$
$$\times (f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}}) \left[\frac{1}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} - \frac{1}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}}} \right]$$

$$\operatorname{Re} \Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) = \frac{2}{\hbar} \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g_{mn\nu}^{\mathrm{b}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) g_{mn\nu}^{*}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$\underbrace{\times (f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}})}_{\neq 0 \text{ only if } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ is occupied and}} \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} - \frac{1}{\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}}} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\neq 0 \text{ only if } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ is occupied and}$$

$$|m\mathbf{k} + \mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ is empty (or viceversa)}$$

$$\operatorname{Re} \Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) = \frac{2}{\hbar} \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g_{mn\nu}^{\mathrm{b}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) g_{mn\nu}^{*}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$\underbrace{\times (f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}})}_{\neq 0 \text{ only if } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ is occupied and }}_{|m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ is empty (or viceversa)}} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ \varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} \\ \varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} \\ \varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} \\ \varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{$$

$$\operatorname{Re} \Pi_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) = \frac{2}{\hbar} \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g_{mn\nu}^{\mathrm{b}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) g_{mn\nu}^{*}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$\underbrace{\times (f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}})}_{\neq 0 \text{ only if } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ is occupied and }}_{|m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ is empty (or viceversa)}} a_{\mathrm{larger than band gap}}^{*}$$

- Small effect in systems with large gap
- Can be significant in small or zero-gap systems (metals, graphene, degenerate semiconductors)

• Non-adiabatic Kohn-anomaly in graphene



Figures from Pisana et al, Nat. Mater. 6, 198 (2007)

[Approximation: replaced $g^{\rm b}_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})$ by $g_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})]$

• Non-adiabatic phonons in CaC₆



Right figure from Calandra et al, Phys. Rev. B 82, 165111 (2010)

[Approximation: replaced $g^{\rm b}_{mn\nu}({f k},{f q})$ by $g_{mn\nu}({f k},{f q})$]

• Spectral function of boron-doped diamond



Figures from Caruso et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 017001 (2017)

Ż

• Spectral function of boron-doped diamond



$$A_{\mathbf{q}}(\omega) = \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{\nu} \operatorname{Im} \frac{2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}}{\omega^2 - \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^2 - 2\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} \prod_{\mathbf{q}\nu}^{\mathrm{NA}}(\omega)}$$

Figures from Caruso et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 017001 (2017)

• Spectral function of boron-doped diamond



Figures from Caruso et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 017001 (2017)

Phonon lifetimes from electron-phonon interactions

$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = 2\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\left|\operatorname{Im}\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right|$$
$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = 2\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\left|\mathrm{Im}\,\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right|$$

$$\begin{split} \frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} &= \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} 2 \sum_{mn} \int \! \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g^{\mathrm{b}}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) g^{*}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) \\ &\times \left(f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} \!-\! f_{n\mathbf{k}} \right) \delta(\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} \!-\! \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} \!-\! \hbar \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu}) \end{split}$$

$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = 2\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\left|\mathrm{Im}\,\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right|$$

$$\begin{split} \frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} &= \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} 2 \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g^{\mathrm{b}}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) g^{*}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) \\ &\times \left(f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}} \right) \underbrace{\delta(\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})}_{|m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ above } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle} \end{split}$$

$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = 2\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\left|\mathrm{Im}\,\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right|$$

$$\begin{split} \frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} &= \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} 2 \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g^{\mathrm{b}}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) g^{*}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) \\ &\times \underbrace{\left(f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}}\right) \delta(\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})}_{|m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ empty}} |m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ above } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle \\ &= \frac{|\mathbf{k}\rangle}{|\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ occupied}} \end{split}$$

$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = 2\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\left|\operatorname{Im}\Pi^{\mathrm{NA}}_{\mathbf{q}\nu}(\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})\right|$$

$$\frac{1}{\tau_{\mathbf{q}\nu}} = \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} 2 \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} g^{\mathrm{b}}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) g^{*}_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$\times \underbrace{\left(f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - f_{n\mathbf{k}}\right) \delta(\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \hbar\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})}_{|m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ empty } |m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}\rangle \text{ above } |n\mathbf{k}\rangle}_{|\mathbf{k}\rangle \text{ occupied}}$$
insulator
$$\underbrace{\int_{\mathbf{k}}^{\mathbf{k}} \int_{\mathbf{k}}^{\mathbf{k}} \int_{\mathbf{k}}^{\mathbf{k}}$$

Approximation often employed in the literature

- Approximate $g^{\rm b}_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})$ using $g_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})$
- Taylor-expand Fermi-Dirac functions using $f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} = f(\varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} + \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})$
- Take limit of zero temperature: $\partial f/\partial \varepsilon \simeq -\delta(\varepsilon-\varepsilon_{\rm F})$
- Neglect phonon energy

Approximation often employed in the literature

- Approximate $g^{\rm b}_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})$ using $g_{mn\nu}({\bf k},{\bf q})$
- Taylor-expand Fermi-Dirac functions using $f_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} = f(\varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} + \omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu})$
- Take limit of zero temperature: $\partial f/\partial \varepsilon \simeq -\delta(\varepsilon \varepsilon_{\rm F})$
- Neglect phonon energy

$$\gamma_{\mathbf{q}\nu} = 2\pi \,\omega_{\mathbf{q}\nu} \sum_{mn} \int \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{\Omega_{\mathrm{BZ}}} \left| g_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) \right|^2 \delta(\varepsilon_{n\mathbf{k}} - \varepsilon_{\mathrm{F}}) \,\delta(\varepsilon_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} - \varepsilon_{\mathrm{F}})$$

'Double-delta' approximation to the phonon linewidth in metals

(Note this is the half-width at half-maximum)

Example of phonon linewidths

• Phonon linewidths of MgB₂, IXS vs. DFT



FIG. 1 (color online). Energy loss scan in almost transverse geometry measured at $\mathbf{Q} = (1 \ 2 \ 0.3)$ corresponding to 0.6 Γ -A. The data, normalized to the incident flux, are shown with the least-squares fit (dashed line) and the *ab initio* spectrum with and without broadening due to experiment and electron phonon coupling (solid lines).



Figures from Shukla et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 90, 095506 (2003)

Matrix element from many-body theory

$$g_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) = \langle u_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} | \int d\mathbf{r}' \ \epsilon_{\rm e}^{-1}(\mathbf{r},\mathbf{r}',\omega) \ \Delta_{\mathbf{q}\nu} v^{\rm en}(\mathbf{r}') \ |u_{n\mathbf{k}}\rangle$$

Matrix element from many-body theory

$$g_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) = \langle u_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} | \int d\mathbf{r}' \underbrace{\epsilon_{e}^{-1}(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', \omega)}_{\mathbf{k}} \Delta_{\mathbf{q}\nu} v^{en}(\mathbf{r}') | u_{n\mathbf{k}} \rangle$$

Exact dielectric matrix
(includes all el-el and el-ph interactions)

Matrix element from many-body theory

$$g_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) = \langle u_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} | \int d\mathbf{r}' \underbrace{\epsilon_{e}^{-1}(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', \omega)}_{\mathbf{k}} \Delta_{\mathbf{q}\nu} v^{en}(\mathbf{r}') | u_{n\mathbf{k}} \rangle$$

Exact dielectric matrix
(includes all el-el and el-ph interactions)

In DFT we approximate $\epsilon_{e}^{-1}(\mathbf{r},\mathbf{r}',\omega)$ as $\epsilon_{DFT}^{-1}(\mathbf{r},\mathbf{r}')$ & pseudopotential approximation

Matrix element from many-body theory

$$g_{mn\nu}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) = \langle u_{m\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}} | \int d\mathbf{r}' \underbrace{\epsilon_{e}^{-1}(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', \omega)}_{\mathbf{q}\nu} \Delta_{\mathbf{q}\nu} v^{en}(\mathbf{r}') | u_{n\mathbf{k}} \rangle$$

Exact dielectric matrix
(includes all el-el and el-ph interactions)

In DFT we approximate $\epsilon_{\rm e}^{-1}({\bf r},{\bf r}',\omega)$ as $\epsilon_{\rm DFT}^{-1}({\bf r},{\bf r}')$ & pseudopotential approximation

- Sensitivity to XC functional
- Suppression of non-adiabatic effects in the matrix elements

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions



Figures from Verdi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115, 176401 (2015)

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions



Figure from Verdi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115, 176401 (2015)

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions



Figure from Verdi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115, 176401 (2015)

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions

$$g(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) = g^{\mathcal{S}}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) + g^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q})$$

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions

$$g(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) = g^{\mathcal{S}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) + g^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$g^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) = i\frac{4\pi}{\Omega}\frac{e^2}{4\pi\varepsilon_0}\sum_{\kappa} \left(\frac{\hbar}{2N_pM_{\kappa}\omega_{\mathbf{q}}}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \times \sum_{\mathbf{G}\neq-\mathbf{q}} \frac{(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot\mathbf{Z}_{\kappa}^*\cdot\mathbf{e}_{\kappa}(\mathbf{q})}{(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^{\infty}\cdot(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})} \langle\psi_{\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}}|e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot(\mathbf{r}-\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa})}|\psi_{\mathbf{k}}\rangle_{\mathrm{sc}}$$

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions

$$g(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) = g^{\mathcal{S}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q}) + g^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathbf{k}, \mathbf{q})$$

$$g^{\mathcal{L}}(\mathbf{k},\mathbf{q}) = i\frac{4\pi}{\Omega}\frac{e^2}{4\pi\varepsilon_0}\sum_{\kappa} \left(\frac{\hbar}{2N_pM_{\kappa}\omega_{\mathbf{q}}}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \times \sum_{\mathbf{G}\neq-\mathbf{q}} \frac{(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot\mathbf{Z}_{\kappa}^*\cdot\mathbf{e}_{\kappa}(\mathbf{q})}{(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot\boldsymbol{\epsilon}^{\infty}\cdot(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})} \langle\psi_{\mathbf{k}+\mathbf{q}}|e^{i(\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{G})\cdot(\mathbf{r}-\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\kappa})}|\psi_{\mathbf{k}}\rangle_{\mathrm{sc}}$$

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions



Figure from Verdi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115, 176401 (2015)

• Wannier interpolation in the presence of Fröhlich interactions



Figure from Verdi et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115, 176401 (2015)

Take-home messages

- Quantum field theory offers a rigorous and unambiguous framework to study phonons beyond DFT
- We can calculate non-adiabatic corrections to the phonon dispersion relations
- We can calculate phonon linewidths and lifetimes associated with electron-phonon interactions

References

- F. Giustino, Rev. Mod. Phys. 89, 015003 (2017) [link]
- G. Baym, Ann. Phys. 14, 1 (1961) [Link]
- E. G. Maksimov, Sov. Phys. JETP 42, 1138 (1976) [Link]
- L. Hedin and S. Lundqvist, *Effects of electron-electron and electron-phonon interactions on the one-electron states of solids*, Ed. Seitz, Turnbull, and Ehrenreich, Solid State Physics, Vol. 23 (Academic, 1969)
- M. Calandra, G. Profeta, and F. Mauri, Phys. Rev. B 82, 165111 (2010)
- T. Kato, T. Kobayashi, and M. Namiki, Prog. Theor. Phys. 15, 3 (1960) [Link]
- C. Verdi and F. Giustino, Phys. Rev. Lett. 115 (17), 176401 (2015) [Link]
- J. Sjakste, N. Vast, M. Calandra, and F. Mauri, Phys. Rev. B 92, 054307 (2015) [Link]