



**The Abdus Salam
International Centre for Theoretical Physics**



SMR/1856-5

2007 Summer College on Plasma Physics

30 July - 24 August, 2007

**Nonlinear Dynamics of Incoherent
Superstrong Radiation in a Plasma.**

N. Tsintsadze
*Georgian Academy of Sciences
Andronikashvili Institute of Physics
Tbilisi, Georgia*

Nonlinear Dynamics of Incoherent Superstrong Radiation in a Plasma

N. L. Tsintsadze

Co-author: L. N. Tsintsadze

**Department of plasma physics, institute of physics,
G.A.S. Georgia**

Analogy between a photon in a plasma and a free material particle

$$\varepsilon = c\sqrt{p^2 + m_0^2c^2}$$

or

$$\varepsilon = \frac{m_0c^2}{\sqrt{1 - \frac{v^2}{c^2}}}$$

Photon in a Vacuum

$$v \leq c$$

$$\omega = kc, \quad v_\varphi = \frac{\omega}{k} = \frac{\partial\omega}{\partial k} = c.$$

$$\varepsilon_\gamma = p \cdot c$$

then $p = 0, \varepsilon_\gamma = 0 (\omega = 0)$

we can say in the vacuum photon exists only in motion.
However the light can be stopped in different mediums

$$(\vec{p} = \vec{k} = 0, \text{ but } \omega \neq 0, \varepsilon_\gamma \neq 0)$$

For a plasma

$$\omega = \sqrt{\omega_p^2 + k^2 c^2}$$

or

$$\varepsilon_\gamma = c \sqrt{p^2 + m_\gamma^2 c^2}$$

or

$$\epsilon_\gamma = \frac{m_\gamma c^2}{\sqrt{1 - \frac{u_\gamma^2}{c^2}}}$$

$$u_\gamma = c \left(1 - \frac{\omega_p^2}{\omega^2} \right)^{1/2} \leq c \quad m_\gamma = \frac{\hbar \omega_p}{c^2}$$

Momentum of the photon

$u_\gamma = \frac{\partial \omega}{\partial k}$ is the group velocity.

$$\vec{p}_\gamma = \hbar \vec{k} = \frac{m_\gamma \vec{u}_\gamma}{\sqrt{1 - \frac{u_\gamma^2}{c^2}}}$$

Thus the wave packets of light propagate with a group velocity ($u_\gamma < c$) in accordance with the theory of relativity

Skin depth

$$\lambda_c = \frac{2\pi c}{\omega_p} = \frac{2\pi\hbar}{m_e c}$$

takes the simple meaning of the Compton wavelength of a photon in a plasma

In the relativistic theory a coordinate uncertainty in a frame of reference in which the particle is moving with energy \mathcal{E} is

$$\Delta q \sim \frac{c\hbar}{\mathcal{E}}$$

For Photons

$$\Delta q = \frac{c}{\omega} = \begin{cases} \lambda & \omega_p^2 \ll k^2 c^2 \\ \lambda_c & \omega_p^2 \gg k^2 c^2 \end{cases}$$

or the characteristic dimensions of the problem should be large in comparison with the wavelength or the Compton length

In the quantum field theory the eigenvalues of the Hamiltonian are

$$E = \sum_{\vec{k}, \sigma} \left(n_{\vec{k}, \sigma} + \frac{1}{2} \right) \hbar \omega(\vec{k})$$

Wigner-Moyal Equation in quantum theory

$$\left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + \frac{\vec{p}}{m} \frac{\partial}{\partial \vec{r}} - \frac{2}{\hbar} \sin \left(\frac{\hbar}{2} \frac{\partial}{\partial \vec{p}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \vec{r}} \right) \right] V(\vec{r}) F(\vec{r}, \vec{p}, t) = 0$$

Relativistic Kinetic Equation for the Photon Gas

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} N(\vec{k}, \omega, \vec{r}, t) + \frac{c^2}{\omega} (\vec{k} \cdot \nabla) N(\vec{k}, \omega, \vec{r}, t) \\ - \omega_p^2 \sin \frac{1}{2} (\nabla_{\vec{r}} \cdot \nabla_{\vec{k}} - \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \frac{\partial}{\partial \omega}) \rho \frac{N}{\omega} = 0$$

where $\rho = \frac{n_e}{n_{0e}} \frac{1}{\gamma}$, γ is the relativistic **gamma**

factor of the electrons

gamma can be expressed as

$$\gamma(\bar{r}, t) = \sqrt{1 + Q} = \sqrt{1 + \beta \int \frac{d\bar{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d\omega}{2\pi} \frac{N(\bar{k}, \omega, \bar{r}, t)}{\omega}}$$

$$\beta = \frac{2\hbar\omega_p^2}{m_0 n_0 c^2}$$

The total number of Photons

$$N = 2 \int d\bar{r} \int \frac{d\bar{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d\omega}{2\pi} N(\bar{k}, \omega, \bar{r}, t) = \text{const}$$

Hence the chemical potential of the photon gas is not zero

In the geometric optics approximation
the one-particle **Liouville-Vlasov equation**
with an additional term

$$\frac{\partial N}{\partial t} + \frac{c^2}{\omega} (\bar{k} \cdot \bar{\nabla}) N - \frac{\omega_p^2}{2} (\nabla \rho \cdot \nabla_k - \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \frac{\partial}{\omega}) \frac{N}{\omega} = 0$$

here there are two forces of distinct nature which
can change the occupation number of photons

$$\nabla \rho = \nabla \left(\frac{n_e}{n_0} \right) = \frac{1}{\gamma} \left(\nabla \frac{n_e}{n_0} - \frac{1}{\gamma} \frac{n_e}{n_0} \nabla \gamma \right)$$

1st one is just **Compton scattering process**, **2nd** is
new type of **Compton scattering-photon scatters**
on the wave packet

Existence of the longitudinal photons

We have shown that $\frac{\delta n_e}{n_{0e}} \ll \frac{\delta n_\gamma}{n_{0\gamma}}$

$$1 + \frac{\omega_p^2}{2\gamma^3} \beta \int \frac{d^3k}{\omega(k)} \left\{ \frac{N_0^+ (\bar{k} + \bar{q}/2)}{\omega(\bar{k} + \bar{q}/2)} - \frac{N_0^- (\bar{k} - \bar{q}/2)}{\omega(\bar{k} - \bar{q}/2)} \right\} \frac{1}{\frac{\bar{q}k c^2}{\omega(k)} - \Omega} = 0$$

Ω and \bar{q} are the frequency and wave vector of the longitudinal photons.

$$\varepsilon(p) = \sqrt{v^2 \cdot p^2 + \left(\frac{p^2}{2m_{eff}} \right)^2}$$

well known **Bogoliubov energy spectrum**
(microscopic theory of the **super fluidity**)

Pauli Equation for the Photon Gas

$$\frac{\partial N(\bar{k}, t)}{\partial t} = \sum_{\pm} \int \frac{d^3q}{(2\pi)^3} [W \pm (\bar{k} + \bar{q}, \bar{k}) N(\bar{k} + \bar{q}, t) - W \pm (\bar{k}, \bar{k} + \bar{q}) N(\bar{k}, t)]$$

where $W \pm (\bar{k}, \bar{q})$ is the scattering rate

Bose-Einstein Condensation in Photon Gas

$$\text{where } \varepsilon_k = c\sqrt{p^2 + m_\gamma^2 c^2} - m_\gamma c^2$$

The Photon density

Because $n_\gamma > 0$,

$$n_\gamma = 2 \int \frac{d\bar{p}}{(2\pi\hbar)^3} N(\bar{p}, r)$$

in any point of space

$$m_\gamma(\bar{r})c^2 > \mu_\gamma$$

The critical temperature of the B.E condensation is determined for the fixed points

$$m_\gamma(r_f)c^2 = \frac{\hbar\omega_p}{\gamma^{1/2}(r_f)} = \mu_\gamma$$

For **non-relativistic** temperature

$$T_c \sim n_\gamma^{2/3}$$

For **ultra relativistic** case

$$T_c \sim n_\gamma^{1/3}$$

When the temperature is below critical T_c , the occupation number reads

$$N(\bar{p}, \bar{r}) = \frac{1}{\exp\left(\frac{\varepsilon_{\bar{k}}}{T_\gamma}\right) - 1} + 4\pi^3 n_{0\gamma} \delta(\bar{p})$$

The problem of BEC and evaporation of the Bose-Einstein condensate can be investigated by Fokker-Planck equation, which we shall derive using Pauli equation. We suppose that

$$|\bar{q}| \ll |\bar{k}|, \quad \text{and } \Omega \ll \omega$$

$$W(\bar{k} + \bar{q}, \bar{k}) N(\bar{k} + \bar{q}) \approx W(k) N(k) + \bar{q} \frac{\partial}{\partial \bar{k}} (W N)_{q=0} + \frac{q_i q_j}{2} \frac{\partial^2 W N}{\partial k_i \partial k_j}$$

$$\frac{\partial N}{\partial t} = a \frac{\partial}{\partial k} (\bar{k} N) + \frac{D_0}{2} \nabla_k^2 N$$

where $a = \frac{D_0}{2\sigma_k^2}$, D_0 are the **dynamic friction** and **diffusion coefficients**, respectively

First we neglect the diffusion term and consider **1D case**, the solution of which is

$$N = \frac{f}{k} = \text{const } e^{at}$$

Second

$$\frac{\partial N}{\partial t} = \frac{D_0}{2} \nabla_k^2 N$$

Assuming that initially all the photons are in ground state with

$$k = 0, \text{ or } N_0 = 4\pi^3 n_0 \delta(\bar{k})$$

The solution is

$$N(k, t) = \frac{n_0 e^{-\frac{k^2}{2D_0 t}}}{(2\pi D_0 t)^{1/2}}$$

From here

$$\langle k^2 \rangle = D_0 t$$

We have derived a relation between the diffusion time, t_p and the time of condensation

$$t_p/t_c = k^2 r_0^2, \text{ which is always } \gg 1$$

First Law of Relativistic Thermodynamics

$$(e - i - \gamma \quad \text{or} \quad e - p - \gamma).$$

$$dE_t = dQ - P_t dV,$$

where

$$P_t = \sum_{\alpha} (P_{\perp\alpha} + P_{\parallel\alpha}) + P_{\gamma}$$

In the case of relativistically intense circular polarized EM field, we use the distribution function

$$f_{\alpha} = n_{0\alpha} \frac{\delta\left(\vec{P}_{\perp\alpha} + \frac{e_{\alpha}}{c} \vec{A}_{\perp}\right)}{2m_{0\alpha}c\sqrt{1+a_{\alpha}^2} \cdot K_1\left(\beta_{\alpha}\sqrt{1+a_{\alpha}^2}\right)} \exp\left\{-\frac{c\sqrt{m_{0\alpha}^2c^2 + P_{\perp\alpha}^2 + P_{\parallel\alpha}^2}}{T_{\alpha}}\right\}$$

where

$$a_\alpha^2 = \left(\frac{e_\alpha \vec{A}_\perp}{m_{0\alpha} c^2} \right)^2, \quad \beta_\alpha = \frac{m_{0\alpha} c^2}{T_\alpha},$$

$$P_{\perp\alpha} = \frac{2}{3} \cdot \frac{n_\alpha m_{0\alpha} c^2 a_\alpha^2}{\sqrt{1+a_\alpha^2}} \cdot \frac{K_0\left(\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1+a_\alpha^2}\right)}{K_1\left(\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1+a_\alpha^2}\right)},$$

$$P_{\parallel\alpha} = \frac{1}{3} \cdot n_\alpha \cdot T_\alpha,$$

$$dQ_t = T_e dS_e + T_{i(P)} dS_{(i.P)} + dS_\gamma,$$

Where $S_\alpha = -V \int dp_{\parallel} \int dp_{\perp} f_\alpha \ln f_\alpha$

The entropy per particle

$$s_\alpha = \frac{S_\alpha}{N} = - \left[\ln \frac{n_\alpha}{2 m_{0\alpha} c K_1(\beta_\alpha)} + \right. \\ \left. 1 - \beta_\alpha \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2} \frac{K_2\left(\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2}\right)}{K_1\left(\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2}\right)} \right]$$

For photons

$$P_\gamma = \frac{T_\gamma^4 \beta_\gamma^2}{\pi^2 (\hbar c)^3} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} \frac{e^{\beta_\gamma \cdot l}}{l^2} K_2(\beta_\gamma \cdot l),$$

$$S_\gamma = \frac{VT_\gamma^3 \beta_\gamma^2}{\pi^2 (\hbar c)^3} \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} \frac{e^{\beta_\gamma \cdot l}}{l^2} \left[l\beta_\gamma \left(1 - \frac{l\beta_\gamma}{2} \right) K_3(l\beta_\gamma) + \frac{l^2 \beta_\gamma^2}{2} K_1(l\beta_\gamma) \right].$$

For an adiabatic process the energy is conserved in each subsystem, i.e.

$$ds_{\alpha} = 0 \text{ and}$$

$$\frac{n_{\alpha} e^{-\beta_{\alpha} \sqrt{1+a_{\alpha}^2} G}}{K_1(\beta_{\alpha})} = \text{const}$$

$$G = \frac{K_2(\beta_{\alpha} \sqrt{1+a_{\alpha}^2})}{K_1(\beta_{\alpha} \sqrt{1+a_{\alpha}^2})}$$

$$\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2} \ll 1, \quad m_\alpha c^2 \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2} \ll T_\alpha,$$

$$\frac{n_\alpha \left(1 + \frac{e_\alpha^2 A^2}{T_\alpha^2} \right)}{T_\alpha} = \text{const}$$

In the opposite limit, that is for nonrelativistic temperatures, $\beta_\alpha \sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2} \gg 1$, we obtain

$$n_\alpha \frac{e^{-\beta_\alpha \left(\sqrt{1 + a_\alpha^2} - 1 \right)}}{T_\alpha^{1/2}} = \text{const}$$

For the photons the asymptotic behavior of the entropy, in the case

$$\beta_\gamma = \frac{m_\gamma c^2}{T_\gamma} \ll 1, \quad S_\gamma = S_{0\gamma} (1 + 0,83 \cdot \beta_\gamma),$$

where

$$S_{0\gamma} = \frac{4\pi^2}{45} \left(\frac{T_\gamma}{\hbar c} \right)^3 \cdot V$$

is the entropy in vacuum.

For the case $\beta_\gamma \gg 1,$

$$S_\gamma = S_{0\gamma} \cdot 0,48 \beta_\gamma^{3/2}.$$

In this case the entropy depends on the temperature and the volume as follows

$$S_{\gamma} \approx T_{\gamma}^{3/2} V^{1/4}$$

Thus, for the adiabatic process, we obtain

$$T_{\gamma} V^{1/6} = T_{\gamma} V^{\Gamma-1} = \text{const} .$$

So, the specific heat for the photon gas is

$$\Gamma = \frac{c_p}{c_V} = \frac{7}{6} .$$

Fluctuation of the number of photons

$$\langle (\Delta N_\gamma)^2 \rangle = \frac{T_\gamma N_\gamma^2}{V^2} \left(\frac{\partial V}{\partial P_\gamma} \right)_{T_\gamma}.$$

In the vacuum $\left(\frac{\partial V}{\partial P_\gamma} \right)_{T_\gamma} = \infty, P_\gamma \sim T^4$

In the plasma $P_\gamma = P_\gamma(T, V)$

and $\left(\frac{\partial V}{\partial P_\gamma} \right)_{T_\gamma}$ **is finite.**

We now examine fluctuations in the distribution of photons over the various “quantum” states. The mean values of the occupation numbers n_k in the k th quantum state is

$$\langle n_k \rangle = n_\gamma = \frac{1}{e^{\frac{\varepsilon(k) - \mu_\gamma}{T_\gamma}} - 1}$$

The mean square fluctuation of the occupation number of photons is

$$\langle (\Delta n_k)^2 \rangle = T_\gamma \frac{\partial n_\gamma}{\partial \mu} \quad \text{or} \quad \langle (\Delta n_k)^2 \rangle = n_\gamma (1 + n_\gamma).$$

The first term reflects the corpuscular behavior of the photons, whereas the second term is of the wave origin. In the case, when $|\varepsilon(\kappa) - \mu| \gg T_\gamma$ the first term is larger than the second one.

In the opposite case $|\varepsilon(\kappa) - \mu| \ll T_\gamma$, the distribution function $n_\gamma \gg 1$.

Thus the relative fluctuations of the number of photons does not decrease, when the mean number of photons increases, so that

$$\frac{\langle (\Delta n_k)^2 \rangle}{n_\gamma^2} \sim 1.$$

Boltzmann H-theorem for a photon gas.

In the limit of the spatial homogeneity for the distribution function of photons the Pauli equation was derived by **L. Tsintsadze (2003)**

$$\frac{\partial N(\vec{k}, t)}{\partial t} = \sum_{\pm} \int \frac{d^3 k'}{(2\pi)^3} W_{\pm}(\vec{k}', \vec{k}) \left[\frac{\omega(\vec{k})}{\omega(\vec{k}')} N(\vec{k}', t) - N(\vec{k}, t) \right],$$

where

$$W_{\pm}(\vec{k}', \vec{k}) = \frac{\pi}{4} \frac{\omega_P^4 |\delta\rho(q)|^2}{\omega(k)\omega(\vec{k} \pm \vec{q}/2)} \delta(\Omega - \vec{q} \cdot \vec{u}_{\pm})$$

$$\vec{k}' = \vec{k} + \vec{q}, \quad \vec{u}_{\pm} = \frac{(\vec{k} \pm \vec{q}/2)c^2}{\omega(\vec{k} \pm \vec{q}/2)}, \quad \rho = \frac{n}{n_0} \frac{1}{\gamma}$$

$$S = -k_B V \int \frac{d^3k}{4\pi^3} \left[N(\vec{k}, t) \ln N(\vec{k}, t) - (N(\vec{k}, t) + 1) \ln(1 + N(\vec{k}, t)) \right]$$

where k_B is the Boltzmann's constant.

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = k_B V \int \frac{d^3 k}{4\pi^3} \ln \left(\frac{1 + N(\vec{k}, t)}{N(\vec{k}, t)} \right) \frac{\partial N(\vec{k}, t)}{\partial t}$$

Using the Pauli equation we obtain

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = \frac{k_B V}{2} \sum_{\pm} \int \frac{d^3 k}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 k'}{(2\pi)^3} W_{\pm}(\vec{k}, \vec{k}') F(\vec{k}', \vec{k}),$$

where $F(\vec{k}', \vec{k}) =$

$$\ln \left(\frac{1 + N(\vec{k}, t)}{1 + N(\vec{k}', t)} \cdot \frac{N(\vec{k}', t)}{N(\vec{k}, t)} \right) (N(\vec{k}', t) - N(\vec{k}, t)).$$

Which is non-negative in any cases, i.e.

$$N(\vec{k}', t) > N(\vec{k}, t)$$

or reverse. Thus,

$$\frac{dS}{dt} \geq 0.$$

Adiabatic Photon Self-Capture

In the geometric optics approximation the Wigner Moyal equation reduces to the one particle Liouville-Vlasov equation

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} N(\vec{k}, \vec{r}, t) + (\vec{u}, \vec{\nabla}) N(\vec{k}, \vec{r}, t) - \nabla U \cdot \nabla N(\vec{k}, \vec{r}, t) = 0,$$

where

$$U = k_P^2 \delta\rho.$$

Let l and τ be the characteristic length and time of variation of the potential. Supposing that

$$\tau \gg \frac{l}{u}.$$

With this condition the solution of the Liouville- Vlasov equation is

$$N(r, k) = n_{0\gamma} \cdot \frac{1}{(2\pi \sigma_0^2)^{3/2}} \exp\left(-\frac{k^2 + k_p^2 \delta\rho}{2\sigma_0^2}\right),$$

where σ_0 is the spectral-width and $\delta\rho$ can be <0 , or >0 .

$$\delta\rho = \frac{\delta n}{n_0\gamma} + \frac{1}{\gamma} - \frac{1}{\gamma_0}.$$

If $\delta\rho < 0$ in some region, and in the rest of the space $\delta\rho > 0$, then we have two sorts of photons. For the case $\delta\rho > 0$, $k^2 + k^2_P \delta\rho > 0$, and for the density of photons

$$n_\gamma = n_{0\gamma} \exp\left(-\frac{k_P^2 \delta\rho}{\sigma_0^2}\right)$$

But in the case, when there are some photons in the cavity, then the motion of photons takes place in a finite region of space, i. e. they are trapped in the potential well

$$U = -k_P^2 |\delta\rho|.$$

Therefore n_γ we can now represent as

$$n_\gamma = n_\gamma^{trap} + n_\gamma^{untrap},$$

where

$$\frac{n_{\gamma}^{trap}}{n_{0\gamma}} = \frac{4}{3\sqrt{\pi}} \left(\frac{k_P}{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sigma_0} |\delta\rho|^{1/2} \right)^3$$

and

$$\frac{n_{\gamma}^{untrap}}{n_{0\gamma}} = \left(1 - \frac{4}{\sqrt{\pi}} \int_0^{\eta_0} d\eta \cdot \eta^2 e^{-\eta^2} \right) \cdot e^{-\eta_0^2},$$

where

$$\eta = \frac{k}{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sigma_0} \quad \text{and} \quad \eta_0 = \frac{k_P |\delta\rho|^{1/2}}{\sqrt{2} \cdot \sigma_0},$$

When $\eta_0 \gg 1$, ($k_P |\delta\rho|^{1/2} \gg \sqrt{2} \sigma_0$), then $n_{\gamma}^{untrap} \rightarrow 0$. In the opposite limit, $\eta_0 \ll 1$, for the density of photons we obtain

$$n_{\gamma} = n_{0\gamma} \left\{ 1 + \eta_0^2 - \frac{8}{15 \cdot \sqrt{\pi}} \eta_0^{5/3} \right\}.$$

Uniform Expansion of the Photon Gas

For the ultrarelativistic photon gas, i. e.

$$T(t) = T_0 \left(\frac{V_0}{V(t)} \right)^{1/3} \frac{1}{1 + \zeta \left(\frac{V(t)}{V_0} \right)^{1/3}},$$

where

$$\zeta = 0,29 \frac{m_\gamma (V_0) c^2}{T_0}$$

and the suffix 0 denotes the constant initial value.

In order to determine the explicit dependence $T(t)$ and $V(t)$, we study the spherically symmetric case. Using the continuity equation with assumption

$$n_\gamma(t) = n_{0\gamma} \left(\frac{R_0}{R(t)} \right)^3 \quad \text{and} \quad u_r = u_0 \frac{r}{R(t)}$$

we obtain for the radius

$$R(t) = R_0 + u_0 t.$$

Thus
$$T(t) = T_0 \frac{R_0}{R(t)} \cdot \frac{1}{1 + \zeta \frac{R(t)}{R_0}}.$$

Nonrelativistic photon gas, i. e.

$$\varepsilon_\gamma \approx m_\gamma c^2 + \frac{P_\gamma^2}{2m_\gamma}$$

$$T(t) = T_0 \left(\frac{V_0}{V(t)} \right)^{1/6} \quad \text{or} \quad T(t) = T_0 \left(\frac{R_0}{R(t)} \right)^{1/2}.$$

References

- L.N.Tsintsadze et al., Proc. Int. Conf. Superstrong Fields in Plasmas (Varenna, 1997), (AIP, 1998), 170
- N.L.Tsintsadze et al., Phys. Plasmas 5, 3609 (1998)
- N.L.Tsintsadze et al., Phys. Plasmas 7, 2348 (2000)
- J.T.Mendonca et al., PRE 62, 4276 (2000)
- L.N.Tsintsadze et al., J.Plasma Phys.55,407,1996
- L.N.Tsintsadze, Phys. Plasmas 11, 855 (2004); (physics/0207074); Hiroshima Univ., Annual Report of VBL 7, 68 (2002); VBL 8, 90 (2003)
- L.N.Tsintsadze, Focus on Astrophysics Research, ed. by Louis V.Ross (Nova Science Publishers, NY, 2003), 147; (astro-ph/0212124)
- N.L.Tsintsadze et al., Physica Scripta T113, 24 (2004); (astro-ph/0611702)