



2369-6

CIMPA/ICTP Geometric Structures and Theory of Control

1 - 12 October 2012

Spherical Tokamaks: Achievements and Prospects

Michael Bell Princeton University USA

Spherical Tokamaks: Achievements and Prospects

Michael Bell

former Head of NSTX Experimental Research Operations Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory Princeton University presented to the Joint ICTP-IAEA College on Plasma Physics International Center for Theoretical Physics, Trieste October 2012

Topics

- Genesis and unique features of the "Spherical Torus" concept
- The worldwide complement of STs and future developments
- ST stability and the effects of non-axisymmetric magnetic fields
- Mitigating divertor heat fluxes
- Controlling plasma-wall interactions through lithium coating
- General features of transport in ST plasmas
- Turbulence measurements and their relationship to transport
- Fast-ion confinement and the effects of MHD instabilities
- Non-inductive generation and sustainment of plasma current

"Spherical Torus" (ST) Pushes the Tokamak to Extreme Toroidicity

- Motivated by potential for increased β [Peng & Strickler, 1980s] β_{max} (= $2\mu_0 \langle p \rangle / B_T^2$) = $C \cdot I_p / aB_T \propto C \cdot \kappa / Aq$
 - B_T: toroidal magnetic field on axis;
 - $\langle p \rangle$: average plasma pressure;
 - I_p: plasma current;
 - a: minor radius;
 - κ : elongation of cross-section;
 - A: aspect ratio (= R/a);
 - q: MHD "safety factor" (> 2)
 - C: Constant ~3%·m·T/MA [Troyon, Sykes - early 1980s]
- Confirmed by experiments
 - − β_{max} ≈ 40%

[START (UK) 1990s]



Growing Number of STs Now Operating Around the World



MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

Spherical Torus Complements and Extends Conventional Aspect-ratio Tokamaks

- High β : β_T up to 40%; on axis $\beta \sim 1$
- Extreme cross-section shaping: elongation $\kappa > 2$, $B_P/B_T \sim 1$
- Large fraction of trapped particles: $\sim \sqrt{\epsilon}$ ($\epsilon = r/R$)
- Large gyro-radius compared to system size: $\rho_i/a \sim 0.02 0.03$
- Large bootstrap current: $I_{Bootstrap} / I_{tot} \sim \sqrt{\epsilon \beta_P} > 50\%$
 - Affects long-term stability of high-beta plasmas
- Large plasma flow & flow shear: Mach number M $\,\sim 0.5$
 - Expect strong effect on ion turbulence
- Large population of supra-Alfvénic fast ions: $v_{NBI}/v_A \sim 4$
 - Mimics alpha-particle population in a burning plasma
- High plasma density at low magnetic field affects electromagnetic waves used for plasma heating

ST Experiments are being Proposed for Fusion Energy Development

- ST combines several potential advantages
 - Compact size
 - High neutron wall loading for nuclear component testing
 - Simplified maintenance scheme
- Considerations for achieving required performance:
 - Adequate confinement

$$\tau_E \propto H_p$$

- High bootstrap current fraction

$$f_{BS} \propto q \beta_N$$

- Adequate margin on safety factor





Pilot Power Plant



ST Design Studies

	β_N	K	H _{98y,2}
FNSF	3-5	2.5-3.2	1.2-1.6
Power Plant	6-8	3-3.5	1.3-1.6

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

NSTX at PPPL Designed to Study High-Temperature Toroidal Plasmas at Low Aspect-Ratio

Center column with TF, OH conductors *Conducting plates for MHD stabilization*



Aspect ratio A	1.27	
Elongation k	2.7	
Triangularity δ	0.8	
Major radius R ₀	0.85m	
Plasma Current I _p	1.5MA	
Toroidal Field B _{T0}	0.6 T	
Pulse Length	1.7s	
Auxiliary heating:		
NBI (100kV)	7 MW	
RF (30MHz)	6 MW	
Central temperature	1 – 3 keV	

NSTX <u>High-Harmonic Fast Wave</u> System Provides Auxiliary Power for Heating and Current Drive

- 12-element antenna for 6MW coupled power at 30MHz
 - $-\omega_{\text{RF}} = 10 15 \times \omega_{\text{c,D}}$ (majority-ion cyclotron frequency)
 - Phase control of currents in antenna elements changes phase velocity of waves launched into plasma





- HHFWs heat electrons by
 - Landau damping: phase velocity $v_{ph} = \omega/k \sim v_{th,e}$
 - Transit-time magnetic pumping: bounce frequency $\epsilon^{1/2}v_{th,e}/qR \sim \omega_{RF}$

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

NSTX Confirmed Capability of ST for High-β in Well-Diagnosed Plasmas



ST Significantly Exceeds Conventional Tokamak Stability Boundaries



- Demonstrates benefits of
 - Low aspect ratio and cross-section shaping
 - Stabilization of MHD modes by nearby conducting plates
 - Active feedback suppression of MHD instabilities
- * CTF: Operating regime of a possible ST-based fusion "Component Test Facility"

Both Boundary Shaping and Profile Variations Impact Reliability of High- β_N Operation

Boundary Shaping Effects

• Define a shape parameter* S

$$S = \frac{q_{95}I_P}{aB_T} \propto \frac{\left(1 + \kappa^2\right)}{A} f(\kappa, \delta, \varepsilon, ...)$$

- "How much safety factor (q_{95}) does the shape have for given I_P and B_T"
- Pulse-average β_N maximized for large values of S



Pressure Profile Shape Effects

• β_N limit calculated to scale inversely with the pressure peaking

$$F_P = \frac{P_0}{\langle P \rangle}$$

- Observations support this dependence
- H-mode produces a broad pressure profile by creating an "edge transport barrier"



NSTX Achieved Non-Inductively Sustained Current Fraction up to 70% in Quiescent High-β Discharges



- Compare
 - Solutions of G-S equation for J(r) with MSE constraint

with

- Modeled evolution of total current with neoclassical resistivity, including
- Inductive Currents
- Beam-Driven current
- Pressure Driven: Bootstrap + Diamagnetic and Pfirsch-Schlüter
- Observe good agreement when low-frequency MHD activity is absent
 - Assume classical beam ion diffusion
 - Data consistent with fast-ion radial diffusivity $D_{FI} < 1.5 \text{ m}^2/\text{s}$

NSTX is Equipped with Non-Axisymmetric **Coils to Control MHD Instabilities at High-** β



6 External 2-Turn Rectangular Control Coils powered by Switching Power Amplifiers (3.5kHz, 1kA)

- Conducting plates stabilize ideal modes when β_N exceeds "no-wall" limit
- Due to finite plate conductivity, plasma can develop "Resistive Wall Mode" (RWM) on timescale for resistive decay of currents in stabilizing plates
- Plasma toroidal rotation profiles affect passive stability to RWMs
- Can suppress RWM growth by active feedback with non-axisymmetric coils based on real-time mode detection by internal sensors

- NSTX coils generate radial field with toroidal harmonic components n = 1, 2 & 3 MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

Correction of n = 3 Error Field Plus Feedback Control of n = 1 Mode Extends High- β_N Plasmas



- Correction of n = 3 intrinsic error field maintains toroidal rotation
- **Resistive Wall Mode** (RWM) grows and eventually terminates discharge when normalized- β exceeds limit for plasma without conducting wall
- Application of n = 1 feedback extends high- β_N duration

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

Variation of Control System Parameters Confirms Action of Feedback Loop

- Detect n=1 magnetic perturbation
 48 B_P, B_R magnetic sensors in vessel
 - Analyze signals in real time to obtain amplitude, toroidal phase
- Apply n=1 radial field with:
 - Amplitude proportional to detected perturbation
 - Phase shifted relative to detected perturbation
- Feedback can be changed from stabilizing to destabilizing as phase varied
- Growth of mode slows toroidal rotation by J × B force between perturbed plasma current and external fields



Fast Visible Images Show Plasma Asymmetry as Resistive Wall Mode Develops

Before RWM activity



RWM with $\Delta B_p = 9 \text{mT}$



Visible light emission comes from plasma edge
 – Core radiates in soft x-ray region

- DCON code models mode structure at boundary
 - uses experimental equilibrium
 - includes n = 1 3 mode components
 - uses relative amplitude / phase of n spectrum measured by RWM sensors
 <u>Modeled structure</u>



MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

MAST Is Equipped with Very Flexible Set of 18 Resonant Magnetic Perturbation (RMP) Coils MAST



6 in upper row

12 in lower row

- Apply perturbations with toroidal harmonic up to n = 6
 - Spatial decomposition contains multiple poloidal (m) components
- Coils can be used both for control of "global" instabilities (*e.g.* kink-like modes) and modes localized to the plasma edge

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

MAST Is Investigating Effect of RMPs on Edge Localized Modes in H-mode



n = 3 produces disruption

MAST

- n = 4 and n = 6 produce
 ELM mitigation
 - up to a factor of 5 increase in ELM frequency
 - similar reduction in ΔW_{ELM}
 - Edge pressure gradient is reduced by RMP
- Observe stronger braking of rotation as n = 6 → 4 → 3
- RMPs have not completely suppressed ELMs in MAST
 - Suppression achieved in conventional tokamaks *under some conditions*

With RMP, Obtain Good Agreement in Edge Structures Between Images and Field Line Mapping



Application of RMP Splits the Outer Strike Point on the Outer Divertor Plate MAST

 High spatial resolution (1mm) IR measurements of divertor plate temperature reveal the splitting as RMP is applied



- Observed only for RMP magnitude above a threshold
 - Currents induced in plasma can shield small applied fields
- Strike point splitting coincides with onset of density reduction MGB/ICTP/1210/#3 Courtesy of A. Thornton and MAST group, CCFE, UK

Reducing Heat Flux on the Divertor Critical for the Success of the ST

- Power flux scaling parameter: $P_{SOL}/(R_{SP}\delta_{SOL})$
 - P_{SOL} : scrape-off layer power
 - R_{SP}: major radius of divertor "strike-point" (separatrix intersects divertor)
 - $\delta_{\text{SOL}}\text{:}$ cross-field width of the scrape-off layer in divertor
 - Intrinsically high in the ST due to high power and small size
 - δ_{SOL} scales roughly as ~ I_{p}^{-1} in both STs and conventional tokamaks
- Can address problem through all three factors
 - Reduce $\mathsf{P}_{\mathsf{SOL}}$ by radiation both from core plasma and locally in divertor
 - Maximize δ_{SOL} by changing magnetic geometry of the divertor
 - Increase $R_{\mbox{\scriptsize SP}}$ by leading outer leg of the separatrix to larger major radius
- Ultimately a combination of techniques plus the development of resilient divertor materials will probably be needed
 - Divertor surface may need to be "self healing" (*e.g.* liquid metals) to survive off-normal transient events

Plasma Shaping Reduces Peak Divertor Heat Flux in NSTX



(small) Measure heat flux to divertor with IR

22 R. Maingi, J. Nucl. Mat. 313-316 (2003) 1005

Partial Divertor Detachment by Divertor Gas Puffing Reduces Peak Heat Flux Without Degrading Core



Intense gas puff creates region of **dense radiating plasma** near divertor •

Core radiation and carbon density are reduced during partial detachment

"Snowflake" Divertor Produced Significant Heat Flux Mitigation in NSTX

- Energize additional PF coils in the divertor to create a *hexapole* field null
 - Single divertor coil produces a quadrupole field null
- Snowflake divertor experiments with P_{NBI} =4 MW, P_{SOL} =3 MW
 - Kept good H-mode confinement
 - Peak divertor heat flux reduced from 3 – 7 to 0.5 – 1 MW/m²
 - Due to combination of snowflake divertor configuration and outer strike-point "detachment" as divertor radiation rises



MAST Will Install Additional Internal PF Coils to Produce an Extended or "Super-X" Divertor MAST



- Physics to be studied:
 - reducing divertor heat loads by radiation and spreading strike zone
 - impact on H-mode access, structure of pedestal and ELMs
 - turbulence and transport in SOL
 - impurity migration and effects on radiation in core and divertor
 - propagation and effects of non-axisymmetric phenomena from core

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3 Courtesy of J. Milnes, W. Morris and MAST group, CCFE, UK P. Valanju, PoP 16 (2009) 056110 25

NSTX Has Explored Use of Lithium Coating on Plasma Facing Components (PFCs)

- Started with lithium pellet injection: applied 5 25mg
- Developed dual lithium evaporators (LITERs) to coat lower divertor
- Evaporate 1 80 mg/min with lithium reservoirs at 520 630°C for 7 – 15 min between discharges
- Shutters interrupt lithium deposition during discharges
- · Withdrawn behind airlocks for reloading with lithium



MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

Lithium Coating Reduces Deuterium Recycling, **Suppresses ELMs, Improves Confinement**



M.G. Bell et al., PPCF 51 (2009) 124054 27

Lithium Coating Improves Both Total and Electron Confinement



- H-mode threshold reduced by lithium by up factor 4
- Electron temperature profile becomes broader with lithium
- Electron thermal transport in outer region progressively reduced by lithium
- Ion confinement remains close to neoclassical both with and without lithium
 MGB/ICTP/1210/#3
 S. Ding et al., PPCF 52 (2010) 015001

28

Lithium Affects ELMs Through Changes in Temperature and Pressure Profile at Edge



 Shift of maximum in pressure gradient to region with lower magnetic shear (∂q/∂r) stabilizes kink/ballooning instability at edge

External Non-Axisymmetric Coils Can *Induce* Repetitive ELMs in Discharges with Lithium Coating



- Applied n = 3 resonant radial field perturbations with NSTX RMP coils
- Induced ELMs reduce n_e, P_{rad}, Z_{eff} with small effect on plasma energy

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

STs Provide New Opportunities to Study Physics of Toroidal Transport Processes

- Operate in unique regions of dimensionless parameters
 - Normalized gyro-radius ρ^* , normalized collisionality ν^*
 - Range of β spans electrostatic to electromagnetic turbulence
- Analysis of NSTX data demonstrated that ion transport was close to neoclassical and that electron transport determined core confinement



• Dependence of electron transport on B-field was a surprise

• Low B \Rightarrow electron gyro-scale turbulence should be measurable ($\rho_e \sim 0.1 \text{ mm}$) MGB/ICTP/1210/#3S. Kaye et al., NF 46 (2006) 848 31

With Lithium Coated PFCs, Global Confinement Trends are Similar to Conventional Aspect Ratio



MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

S. Gerhardt et al., NF 51 (2011) 073031

NSTX Equipped with Diagnostics to Measure Turbulent Density Fluctuations

- Density fluctuations \Rightarrow potential fluctuations $\Rightarrow \tilde{\mathbf{v}} = \tilde{\mathbf{E}} \times \mathbf{B}/B^2 \Rightarrow \text{transport}$
- Probe density fluctuation structures perpendicular to B-field; $\mathbf{k}_{\perp} \neq \mathbf{0}$
 - Structures are extended along B-field: $\mathbf{k}_{II} \approx \mathbf{0}$



0.0

33

Heating Electrons with HHFW Power Drives Short-Wavelength Turbulence in Plasma Core



- Detected fluctuations in range $k_{\perp}\rho_e = 0.1 0.4$ ($k_{\perp}\rho_s = 8 16$) propagate in electron diamagnetic drift direction
 - Rules out Ion Temperature Gradient mode ($k_{\perp}\rho_{s} \sim 1$) as source of turbulence
 - Reasonable agreement with linear gyrokinetic code (GS2) in threshold for destabilization of Electron Temperature Gradient (ETG) modes
- Measured R/L_{Te} does exceed threshold \Rightarrow ETG-induced transport is not "stiff"

Reduction in High-k Turbulence Consistent With Reduced Electron Heat Transport in Outer Plasma

- Compare discharges with and without lithium applied
 - Discharges with lithium have higher global confinement
- Fluctuation spectra measured with microwave scattering



Electron Gyro-Scale Fluctuations Suppressed by Negative Magnetic Shear in Plasma Core



- Suppression of Electron Temperature Gradient (ETG) driven turbulence by shear-reversal had been predicted (F. Jenko & W. Dorland, PRL 2002)
- Shear-reversed q-profile is compatible with bootstrap driven current MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3 H. Yuh et al., PoP 16 (2009) 056120

Strong Confinement Dependence on Collisionality Reproduced in Micro-Tearing Turbulence Simulations



- Lithium has enabled NSTX to achieve lower collisionality
- Strong increase in τ_{E} as ν^{*}_{e} decreases ($\tau_{\text{E}} \propto \chi_{e}^{-1}$)



- Follow mode evolution to "steady" state
- Collisionality varied from experiment
- Predicted χ_e and scaling consistent with experiment ($\Omega \tau_E \sim B_t \tau_E \sim \nu_e^{*-0.8}$)
- Transport dominated by magnetic "flutter"

NSTX Accesses Fast-Ion Phase-Space Regime Overlapping With and Extending Beyond ITER

- Energetic ions from NBI heating in NSTX mimic alpha-particles in ITER
- Energetic ions interact with Alfvén waves and excite toroidal eigenmodes
- When many modes grow they can form an "avalanche instability" which modifies the particle orbits and can eject some ions



MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3

Low Frequency MHD Instabilities Can Also Redistribute Fast Ions

- Initial modes are kink-like, global instabilities with frequencies typically a few kHz
 - Primarily n = 1, weaker n = 2 present
- Add 3-D perturbed field to 2-D equilibrium field and follow orbits of an ensemble of test particles by integration of Lorentz force (SPIRAL code)
- Energetic ions are redistributed
 - Outward radially
 - Towards $V_{\parallel}/V = 1$
- This redistribution can then affect stability of other modes: *AE, RWMs
 - CAE activity observed <u>after</u> onset of low frequency MHD
- CAEs are possible cause of enhanced core electron transport

Resonant with electron orbit frequencies
 MGB/ICTP/1210/#3







TAE Avalanches Lead to Broadening of the Beam Driven Current Profile





- Model using spatially and temporally localized fast-ion diffusivity $D_{FI}(\psi,t)$
 - Use DD neutron dynamics to determine D_{FI}
 - Modeled current profile then matches that inferred from magnetic data

MGB / ICTP / 1210 / #3



Generating and Sustaining the Toroidal Plasma Current in the ST

- There is very little room for a central solenoid winding in the ST
 - Flux swing scales with the square of solenoid radius
 - Protecting the insulation from neutron damage would be very challenging
 - Schemes have been proposed to use iron cores or removable solenoids
- The bootstrap current can provide a large fraction of the toroidal plasma current in the ST
 - Scales as $\sqrt{\epsilon\beta_P}$
- High-energy NBI can also drive significant current

Requires an initial toroidal current ~1MA to confine the ions

 However, techniques are needed to initiate current and to control its profile to maintain optimum MHD stability

We will now discuss methods being investigated in NSTX and MAST

– Many other STs are also actively exploring current drive schemes

NSTX Developing Coaxial Helicity Injection (CHI) for Non-Inductive Initiation of Toroidal Plasma Current



- After $I_{CHI} \rightarrow 0$, toroidal plasma current flows on closed flux surfaces
- Without additional heating and current drive, current decays resistively

CHI Produced Substantial Increases in Plasma Current for Same Applied Inductive Flux



- Lithium coating of lower divertor (electrodes) improved CHI initiation
 - Reduced radiation by carbon and oxygen impurities
- Discharges compared had same waveform of solenoid current
- Reached 1MA using 40% less flux than induction-only case
 - Hollow T_e maintained during current ramp following CHI
 - Higher average T_e reduced resistive flux consumption
 - Low normalized internal inductance I_i ≈ 0.35
 - Aids achieving high elongation
 - B. Nelson et al., NF 51 (2011) 063008 43

Evidence for Current Drive by HHFW by Comparing Co- and Counter- CD Phasing



- Wavenumber $k_T \approx \pm 7m^{-1}$ phase velocity matches ~2keV electrons
- Inductive loop voltage controled by feedback to maintain plasma current
- Difference in voltage required implies 150kA driven by HHFW
- Codes modeling wave interaction calculate 90 230 kA driven by waves MGB/ICTP/1210/#3 J. Wilson et al., PoP 10 (2003) 1733

44

MAST Used Waves in Electron Cyclotron Frequency Range to Drive Current

- Electron cyclotron frequency: $f_{ce} = eB/2\pi m_e = 28$ GHz @ 1T
- O-mode waves only propagate *above* the electron plasma frequency: $f_{pe} = \sqrt{(n_e e^2 / \epsilon_0 m_e)/2\pi} = 28 \text{GHz} @ 1 \times 10^{19} \text{m}^{-3}$
- ST plasma is typically "overdense" \Rightarrow must rely on other wave modes
- The electrostatic Electron Bernstein Wave (EBW) can be generated by Mode Conversion in a plasma from externally launched e.m. waves
- MAST used a mirror with slanted grooves on its center column to change the polarization of waves launched from the outboard side
- The reflected waves (X-mode) convert to EBW in the plasma
- When EBW are absorbed on resonant electrons they can generate current



MAST

100 kW of 28GHz RF Power Generated 17kA Plasma Current by EBW CD in MAST



EBW-driven current augmented by flux from Vertical Field and Solenoid

• Temperature and density peak at electron cyclotron resonance layer MGB/ICTP/1210/#3 V. Shevchenko et al., NF 50 (2010) 022004

46

The ST Is Making Good Progress Toward a FNSF While Contributing to the Physics Basis of ITER

- Ability of the ST to achieve high β now well established
- Advanced plasma stabilization methods and diagnostics being applied to improve performance
- Provides a unique opportunity to study transport and turbulence
- Investigating fast-ion instabilities relevant to ITER
- Developing innovative solutions to heat-flux management
- Developing non-inductive startup and sustainment schemes
- NSTX is currently undertaking a major refit to install additional NBI heating and upgrade its coils
 - Double its NBI power and magnetic field and extend its pulse-length
- MAST will soon install its Super-X divertor and upgrade its heating